



Contents lists available <http://www.kinnaird.edu.pk/>

Journal of Research & Reviews in Social Sciences Pakistan

Journal homepage: <http://journal.kinnaird.edu.pk>



INTERPLAY OF POLITICAL ECONOMY OF CULTURE AND CULTURAL INDUSTRIES OF PAKISTAN

Tayyaba Latif¹, Ali Hassan^{1*}

¹ Department of Media Studies, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur

Article Info

*Corresponding Author

Email Id: alihassan@iub.edu.pk

Keywords

Political economy, Culture, Commodification of audience, Mass deception

Abstract

This article explores the concept of political economy of culture and cultural industries of Pakistan. This is basically a literature review of the existing writings on this issue as well as a critical analysis of the content producing by these cultural industries of Pakistan particularly in the light of Adorno & Horkheimer idea of “Culture industry” as a tool of “mass deception”. This article also talks about structure of power own by media owners in Pakistan as well as how media commoditized its audiences for the sake of revenue and more profits. All the real world examples from Pakistani media are chosen on the basis of their relevancy.



1. Introduction

(Mosco, 2009) defines political economy “the social relations, particularly the power relations that mutually constitute the production, distribution, and consumption of resources”. So, the political economy of culture with reference to media is adopted when media becomes an industry with the most important motive of earning profit rather than to preserve and promote the cultural artifacts in the society. This is commencing on the presumption that

eminent culture pitches to select perceiving buyers, while, low mass created culture focused at the non-cerebral feel, offer all more enormously. So, in this manner the commodification of culture, particularly in media ponders, nourishes into the “political economy of production”. Theodor Adorno and Max Horkheimer from Frankfort School spearheaded the basic and multidisciplinary proposition to deal with cultural appraisal that consolidated literary examination, groups of onlookers and political

economy of the culture produced by the media to comprehend the ideological and social effects of mass culture and interchanges. Their development of the idea of 'culture industries' made the pathway for subsequent investigation of the properties and outcomes of mass-delivered culture for business purposes. They determined that in which way cultural artifacts like music (Adorno, 1932, 1938), radio soap operas (Herzog, 1941), literature, (Lowenthal, 1949), exhibited the characteristics like all other commodities of mass production; particularly "Standardization, Commodification and Massification" (Goodwilliam, 2014), (Adamu, 2017). In media and communication studies the political economy basically evaluates the power connections among media consumers, producers and wholesalers from domestic level to worldwide viewpoint, as well as financial and political agendas of media. Following this way, (Garnham, 1994) evaluates that content of the media all in all financially adapted and controlled by product generation industries. The content of media additionally has ideological capacities and expressly works inside legislative issues. Media evaluation from political economy frame of reference particularly focuses on how informative exercises are organized by the unequal dissemination of material and illustrative assets. Four historical procedures: Developments of the media, augmentation of corporate achieve "commodification" and the changing part of the government and state intercession is imperative in the exchange of political-economy of mass media

(Golding & Murdock, 1996). Now a day's culture is contaminating everything with similarity. Cinema, radio, Television and magazines form a network. Each limb of culture is consistent inside itself and all are consistent simultaneously. Indeed, the aesthetic appearances of political contrary energies broadcast the same unbend-able mood. All forms of mass culture under business monopoly are indistinguishable, and the shapes of its skeleton, the theoretical armature manufactured by restraining infrastructure, are starting to emerge. Movies and radio never again need to introduce themselves as form of art. In fact, they are only business is utilized as a belief system to legitimize the waste they purposefully create. The premise on which innovation is picking up control over society is the energy of those whose monetary position in the public arena is most grounded. Specialized levelheadedness today is the reason-ability of mastery. It is the compelling character of a general public distanced from it. Vehicles, atomic bombs, and movies hold the totality concurrently, until the point when their leveling component exhibits its energy against the very arrangement of inequality it served. Everybody should carry on suddenly as indicated by a "level" controlled by files and to choose the classification of mass item fabricated for their sort. The results of the way of culture industry are with the end goal that they can be vigilantly overwhelmed even in a condition of diversion. Culture is an incomprehensible ware. It is so totally subject to the law of trade that it is never again exchanged; it is so aimlessly compared with utilize

that it can never again be utilized. Hence it converges with the promotion. The more useless the last shows up under monopoly the more supreme culture moves toward becoming. Its intentions are sufficiently monetary (Adorno & Horkheimer, 1944).

1.1 Significance of the study

This paper gives an account of the content producing by Pakistani media in different genres. It also provides an overview to evaluate that how the cultural industries domestically as well as globally producing the cultural artifacts with the sameness. This paper tends to explain that how cultural industries are manipulating the minds of their audiences. It also analyzes that how these industries are selling their viewers as a commodity to the advertisers to get more financial benefits. This study will also help to develop the critical thinking regarding the role of media in the preservation and presentation of cultural artifacts in the audiences' mind.

2. Literature Review

Commodification of culture, an inexorably noteworthy strand in basic explanatory discourse of culture, centers consideration on what emerges when culture is delivered on a mass utilization scale, and dispersed in coordinate rivalry with other privately created social items (Enzensberger, 1974). Cultural elements, especially social portrayal in any type of media is a solid factor in the edibility of messages encoded in the different types of pop culture. Media speaks to all the more in this way, visual media which delineates and remake – and additionally

anatomizes – specific scenes in the lives of people (Adamu, 2017). The function of media is to create consciousness; but media produced just a single item – audiences. It implies that all media collected, bundled, and sold groups of people to sponsors.

Content was optional like a free lunch, best case scenario. Media ventures were neither dream production lines nor cognizance businesses: they are “hunter gatherers” of the group of onlookers (Smythe, 1977). The prime capacity of the whole media is to create group of audience, the potential purchaser group. In the overall relationship of market with media, groups of audiences are indispensable to the point that cost of publicizing spot is controlled by size and social aggregation of the media consumers. They are actually the "principal commodity" in the mass communications industries (Mosco, 1996). Political economy intellectuals additionally contend that the industrialist class uses media, once in a while with the assistance of the state. It tends to settle the talks of the general public and control individuals' observations from various measurements.

Then again, media additionally keep up systematic association with pressure groups for its own particular monetary need and correspondence of intrigue those keep the socio-political request unperturbed alongside guaranteeing benefit expansion for the media proprietors while actualizing industrialist philosophy (Herman, Chomsky, & Hall, 2002, 1989). To study the phenomenon of political economy of culture and function of culture industries two theories are most

relevant because these ideologies uncover the whole phenomenon. First theory is presented by (Meehan, 1984) "Gendering the commodity audiences" contends that media industries not just have a commodity message and viewers are also identifying as commodity yet additionally have commodity evaluations. She focuses on the significance of the inquiry "how do appraisals and the evaluations business fit into the creation of the commodity message?" Also, to answer the inquiry "what commodity is delivered by mass culture businesses?" The ratings business would have an inclination for estimating a specific gathering of people that is probably going to purchase and expend a great deal of products, accordingly "the commodity audiences and commodity evaluations are completely fake and made".

The second theory is presented by (Adorno & Horkheimer, 1944) named as "The Culture Industry: Enlightenment as Mass Deception", in the book *Dialectic of Enlightenment*. They recommended that mainstream culture is similar to a manufacturing plant creating institutionalized cultural merchandise like movies, radio projects, magazines, and so forth, which are utilized to push the mass audiences towards passivity. Consumption of the simple delights of pop culture, made accessible by the mass interchanges media, renders individuals compliant and content, regardless of how troublesome their economic conditions. The inalienable risk of the way of culture industry is the development of false mental needs that must be met and fulfilled by the products of corporate capitalist firms.

3. Cultural Industries in Pakistan

The expression "cultural industries" incorporates "human expressions and innovative segments that envelop yet are not restricted to, distributing, cinema, music, photography, outline, design and tourism (Singh, 2006). A report published by British Council reveals that Pakistan's cultural and innovative ventures can contribute \$1.5 billion to the economy; all it needs is a bit 'push in the correct course. The cultural industries of Pakistan are comprising of Television with all of its genres, Radio, Films, Music, Print media, Literature, and Publishing houses etc. However, for the sake of this study we will discuss those mediums in more detail which have maximum penetration in the society. The data for this analysis is collected from official websites of *Pakistan Bureau of Statistics*, *Government of Pakistan* (Year book report of 2015) and *Media Logic Pvt. Limited* latest reports available online as well as from different articles published in famous Urdu and English newspapers recently.

3.1 The Television Industry

Despite the fact that TV was presented as a basic device for national improvement, in a large portion of the cases it is overwhelmingly utilized for business purposes. Radicals like (Kellner, 1990) contend that, TV never attempts to modify central political or monetary structures and foundations, rather fill in as solid ideological and business arms of the entrepreneur framework by giving intense instrument to offering the qualities and in addition way of life of corporate private enterprise. In reality, everywhere throughout the world TV stations are

generally claimed by the business moguls for their greater financial and political intrigue. Investigating the development of TV channels owned by the private people in the post-frosty war of Russia (McNair, 2000) watches that an individual from upper class put resources into media business to increase political impact and shape Russian culture in industrialist mode: and this possession reliably empower them to deal with the legislature both politically and financially, and guarantees star business and free-market culture alongside expanding benefits of these stations and additionally their worries. TV is the medium that has greatest reach to the remote territories and in addition the urban zones in Pakistan. Total number of TV sets in Pakistan according to latest report by *Pakistan Bureau of statistics* is 14,245,083. Additionally, TV doesn't require any education and its demonstrates the story hence does not require any kind of capabilities by the audiences, in this manner it turns into the most supportive medium in impacting the people's perceptions about real world (Gerbner & Gross, 1976). Total number of channels owned by Pakistani television industry is almost 117 in numbers according to PEMRA including Cooking, News, Sports, Entertainment, Music, Movies, Cartoon, Health, and Islamic channels. PTV is a state owned channel with a number of channels under its umbrella in different regional languages as well.

It is the most penetrated network in Pakistan; however, there are private media conglomerates like GEO network, ARY network, HUM network and

EXPRESS network etc. All above mentioned television networks owned different channels like sports, entertainment, news and cooking categories. But here, we will analyze the sameness of content and reproduction of stereotypes of a patriarchal society by these cultural industries, that how they feed same type of content to the audiences again and again, and commodification of audience to the advertisers facilitated by these media industries to get financial benefits.

3.1.1 TV Dramas

TV drama assumes a dynamic part in training, stimulation and restricting society in national culture. Pakistan TV shows played a positive part in safeguarding of social standards and promotion of traditional cultural values of the society. Like, from past drama serials Alpha Bravo Charlie, Spahi Maqbool Hussain in dispensing with social shades of malice, serials Warris, Ahat, Bezuban and Bint-E-Adam about love, Liari Express, in giving good lesson, Ek Muhabat Su Afsany, in patriotism, Jinnah Se Quid, for the sake of entertainment, Dillagi and so on (Huma, 2015). After the growth of private entertainment channels particularly from 2000, s to till Pakistani dramas have developed from black n white to colorful but at the same time from plotful to plot less age. The most common criticism on Pakistani TV serials are that they are creating and reproducing the existing stereotypes of the society. They are presenting the same content again and again; to get more ratings TV dramas are just disseminating the glamour, low level romance and stereotyped characters. There is absence of creative

plots. They are still depicting the old Saas-Bahu or “Bad woman” versus “Good women” characters as well as typical romantic love stories or now extra marital relations are the main issues on most of the TV dramas (Ajaz, 2017).

Pakistani dramas are reinforcing stereotypes in the race of money making and ratings, they claim diversity in similarity. One recent example is of the characters of obsessed male lovers which are portraying in many dramas one after the other because these characters are most popular and achieve high ratings these roles are more popular among teenage girls particularly so every channel try the same formula for example, leading role of “Pasha” from Tahir e Lahoti, on Hum TV in 2008, “Saud” from Nikher Gaay Ghulaab Saarey on Hum TV in 2012, “Taimur” from Manjali on Geo TV in 2016 and recently “Mir Haadi” from Khaani on Geo TV in 2017 are just few dramas with almost same storyline in which usually (however not generally) an affluent playboy resolved to get the young lady, and may even abduct the young lady being referred to, all for the sake of adoration. Obviously he gets the young lady and either changes or proceeds in villainy. But in real world such individuals don't exist and in the event that they did than, it would be an illegitimate case not wellspring of sentimental dream. And most of these drama stories are already published in digests so there is no variety in the content. Admiring this sort of conduct in at any rate prompts culture of provocation and steady threat for ladies. Another stereotype which is reproduced about the women that there is just a single man in

this whole World that can fulfil this lady; lamentably for her, and then her lover weds another person. So, she makes a plan to ruin his married life and ultimately get success “Sara” from Humsafar, “Deeba” from Daagh, “Tabinda” from Sheher e Zaat and “Maya” from Na kaho Tum Merey Nahin are such cases of these stereotypes and audiences most of the time perceive this notion as (Ourat hi ourat ka ghar kharab karti ha) means a woman defects the woman's house. This type of crying and miserable women characters get more ratings which is the ultimate goal of this commercialized drams so most of the drams even written by different writers, for different channels, and directed by different directors have the same women characters, same locations, same themes and same looks.

No one except few bothers to try different ideas because the ultimate goal is profit which is easily attained by these traditional formulas (Sadaf, 2013). Increasingly the marvel of “similarity” isn't just seen as far as topics or story lines, however in additionally regarding thoughts and ideas crosswise over various media. Some dramas like “Zra yad kar, “Mann Mayal”, “Pakeeza”, “Tumhary Siwa” on aired from Hum TV at the same time period with the same issue of “Halala” and “Nikkaah”, while, “Khuda daikh raha ha” on Aplus TV in 2015 and “Dil lagi” from ARY TV are on the same issue as well on aired at the same time and all these dramas had highest ratings due to controversial stories. As the notion of sameness is concerned, majority of dramas are made on the stories already published in “Khawateen”, “Shuaa” and “Kiran” monthly digests.

Same digest writers are rewriting the digest stories for drama even for movies now. Same content is producing and reproducing again and again and it sells unfortunately. At the same time there are many dramas like, Udaari, Sammi, Dar Si Jaati Hai Sila, on Hum TV while, Khudgarz, Khuda mera bhi hai, Chup Raho, Muqabil, on ARY Digital and Dhund on TV ONE are recent example of dramas highlighting the taboos of our society like child abuse, early marriages, transgender problems, violence on women, sexual abuse, misogyny, honor killing, single parenthood etc. These drams telecasted from different channels from last two three years. These plays also started a debate in the society about these problems and tend to aware people to raise their voices against any type of exploitation particularly women and children. But this is also a reality that majority of the dramas are not the real image of Pakistani culture and society. There are story lines that are uncommon; which offer on their ways of life and portrayals of high class culture. In any run of the mill dramatizations, the characters are appeared to wear impeccable dresses and branded Jewel lay, living in big bungalows and going in extravagant vehicles.

Every drama is portraying a lavish life style, even middle class family is living in thousand square feet houses; furnished with extraordinary items, people wearing branded clothes etc. These dramas are disseminating false realities of the real world in the minds of their viewers to get economic benefits not only for them but for their advertisers too. According to Horkheimer, these simple joys

influence individuals "to feel" content, and provide them pointless as far as diligent work, regardless of how troublesome their economic conditions are (Horkheimer & Adorno, 2001).

3.1.2 Morning Shows

In every morning when clock strike 9 in Pakistan, people are given a rundown of different morning shows to browse. This pattern of morning indicates began from the well-known *Nadia Khan Show* on Geo TV and now from territorial to national level each channel from Monday to Friday have morning appears. Everywhere throughout the world, morning demonstrates are led in light of the fact that the media of those nations utilize those morning appears as an approach to instruct their viewers particularly house wives. In whatever is left of the world, these shows take into account all unique age sections and spotlight on various issues that distinctive individuals confront however with regards to Pakistan, morning demonstrates are a totally extraordinary story. In every morning show of every channel, all the hosts are on the circle about pretty much with same content that they really had nothing new else to discuss. Each lady ought to be reasonable; like, every lady regardless of her age ought to be size 0, Every Pakistani lady needs beautiful long hairs, while, playing ghastly games is a declaration of joy and excitement, Every Pakistani lady should keep an eye on her better half, how praiseworthy recently married celebrity couples are. Indeed, these are the subjects that you will just observe being talked about and analyzed time and

again on our morning appears as though there is nothing more to life than this.

Ladies as of now are so difficult on themselves, to a point where each lady, each and every day feels shaky about herself, her body or her general identity and then come these morning show has who are shallow deeply, who push these uncertainties and edifices more and rub these non-issues (Mirza, 2016). This endless competition of ratings, to get more sponsors and cash, even powers them doing some strange demonstrations, also, from cooking competitions and market visits to the degree of airing marital fights, and wedding occasions as well remarriages of showbiz couples. Same topics are trailed by the hosts crosswise over channels. What's more, the hosts advance costly way of life products, making the "unlimited markets "for the monetary mammoths. When the show begins, the host gives off an impression of being in un-normally costly garments, discussing their subject of the day, and the name in addition to address, site, and web-based social networking points of interest of the dress planner (Host) of the dress. While on the show, some visitor is welcomed (for the most part a cosmetics specialists), who discusses the subject related issue, for example, dresses, jewellery and make up. Unimportant subjects are chosen, for example, making the best cosmetics look, which make the viewers are danger of disappointment about their self-perception and extents or facial highlights or at the base develop an optimistic perspective of their general surroundings (Schooler, Monique, Merriwether, & Caruthers, 2004).

The present part with bridal look hosts expressing gratitude toward there a lot of fashioners is definitely not an instrument to shape society; rather they are 'de-forming' minds influencing them to superficial. They influence the viewers to dream of a way of life loaded with everlasting ecstasy, expanding the uniqueness among the majority. The organizations spend in millions to dispatch or to publicize their items on these supposed 'morning shows' as they have a radical new market that consume this content (Khan, 2013).

Despite the fact the majority of the audiences of morning shows are house wives belong to middle and lower middle class but these shows present a glamorous world, lavish living style create the sense of inferiority and highlights the difference between the haves and have notes of the society. They commodify their audiences for sake of more profit by advertisers.

3.1.3 Ramadan Transmissions on TV

Today on every TV channel Ramadan transmission starts with an exchange between a host and a group of maulvis, who are clad in beautifully weaved kurtas. The genuine justification of these shows is business in light of the fact that these shows make tremendous benefits for the channels. The channels advance and market items, however that simply doesn't end there in light of the fact that they invite the showbiz celebrities and cash their stardom to earn money and ratings (Butt, 2016). Tune in to one of our television channel Ramadan transmissions and master all that you have to think about this heavenly month and Islam. On these shows, you are

shown that nothing matters more than winning a branded suit or footwear, or a washing machine and motor bike.

Consistently, international brands, for example, Coca-Cola, Pepsi and Nestle and local brands of clothing, cooking oils and motorbikes can be seen in Ramadan-unique promotions that abruptly spin around otherworldly existence and religion. Islamic banking turns out to be much more main stream and restaurants go hard and fast to have fantastic whatever you-can-eat arrangements to draw clients in. Bundle a show with almost no substance, loads of unconditional presents, 'religious-sounding' ambient melodies and spot the set with an Islamic researcher all over. They allow TV producers to curve and control religious notions as well as enable companies to utilize us, once more, to make economic benefits (Sajjad, 2014).

These so-called Ramadan transmissions on the name of religion is just a source of advertisements for the big companies and brands as well as channels earn a huge profit by exploiting the religious sentiments of their viewers. In Pakistan this is the most relevant example of commodification of audiences.

3.1.4 News Channels and Talk shows

Pakistan's print and electronic news media is facing another deceptive kind of weight. Corporate interests, influence of political parties and government endeavors to manage and censorship of information all put incredible pressure on a foundation as yet rising up out of many years of concealment under military despots. And keeping in mind that current tumult and strife have empowered

the print and broadcast media of Pakistan to prosper, the industry now faces a junction: It is attempting to keep up journalistic morals that run in opposition to the business ethos in which it works. Pakistani news room has turned into the "space of a corporate intrusion." That example coordinates a bigger pattern all through South Asia, where a nexus among media owners, financial backers, other stakeholders and advertisers confines the media's capacity to report without inclination (Shah, 2015). Pakistani, s news channels likewise appear to have under the spell of 'equivalence', the possibility that each news channel needs to "break" news to the viewers, with all the sensation. War, bomb impacts, deaths, bloodshed or even an ordinary case continuing in the Supreme Court, every news start with the tag of breaking news and each channel guarantees the onlookers to bring the news "first". This winds up with all the news channels discussing "similar news". A casing of "dread" and peril is made, that renders the viewer's meek (Altheide, 1997).

This all breaking news and sensationalism is just for sake of ratings. All the channels follow the same formula even the same story in every bulletin is presented as the latest news so that maximum number of audience get attract to this news again and again and channels can get more advertisements. Mass deception on the name of information is the most common practice in news media now days.

3.2. Cinema

Utilizing on the passionate esteem appended with a film and various types of movies created, advertisers and brands have the chance to connect their brands

with the correct pictures through "in-film advertisements" A recognizable pattern as respects utilizing story line of the film to publicize items has been seen in the current past. The items decided for publicizing through this medium have shifted from cars to soda pops, articles of clothing, electronics, mobile phones, services, and pharmaceuticals to give some examples (Kaur, 2014). In Pakistan cinema is evolving after a long time period, particularly after BOL movie in 2007. Film production started again but at the same time the product placement in the movies has been introduced in a new but a pathetic way like from recent examples, in 2015, a mobile company "Rivo" sponsored a whole song in the movie Wrong number with title "Selfian hi selfian". In Dekh Magar Pyaar Say an entire jingle of McDonalds is picturized for product promotion. In Karachi Se Lahore movie a whole item song is on "Tutti Fruti ice cream". In teen bahadur "Gluco biscuit" took product placement to another level that is unsuitable to the glory of animated movies particularly. Sameness of the content is another problem, a recent example is movie Bin Roay this novel was first published in a digest than a movie is made on it and after the success of movie a drama with same name, same characters is presented on TV. Folk stories like "Heer Ranjha" "Anaarkali and Saleem" were made again and again in the form of movies, as well as in drama not only in Pakistan but in Bollywood too. It is also a reality that not all the movies are same there are some classic movies with new plots and different story lines addressing the

issues of the Pakistani society but it happens rare. Most of the time movies promote consumerism and sell their audiences to the corporates to earn maximum profit.

3.3. Music Industry

In Pakistan, music industry is also taken over by the corporate sponsorship. Coke Studio by *Coca Cola* and Nescafe Basement by *Nestle* are the best examples. Mobilink sponsored a whole song to promote Jazz "Jazba-Dekha na tha", "Zalima Coca cola pila day" by Coke Studio are the worst examples of corporate sponsored music. These sponsored musical programs are playing an important role to promote music and young talent as well, but these are also creating a monopoly on music industry on the whole. Favoritism restricts the new talents most of the time, there are just "popular names". Another factor is recreation of the old music, so old lyrics with just new voice is producing. Along these lines imagination is hampered, and the restraining infrastructure is held by the corporate factor.

3.4. Advertising

Media is one of the key powers that advance a purchaser conduct, and shape and make new needs, for the maintainability of the market. Now media is not used as "Push" strategy but "pull" the audiences, through media advertisements brand culture is becoming more popular, branded products are now desirable and fascinating because media portray these items in such an attractive way that people get attracted towards these commodities (Mont & power, 2010).

Some of the examples are like, Pakistani Lawn brand campaign hire *Kareena Kapoor* and *Jacqueline Fernandez* from Bollywood this was not about the quality of the stuff but to attract more women that these celebrities wore these suits so i should purchase it. For LUX soap ad *Mahira Khan* and *Fawad Khan*'s couple was considered to cash their fame and to pull the more consumers for this soap. Advertising is now for everyone regardless of age, class and gender.

No one can get rid of this like fairness creams for men and women, shampoos are now for both genders as well as for children (Johnson's ad) even drinks are now advertised as for adventurous people (Dew ad is the case) and for "ordinary" people. Subsequently these kind of advertising techniques not simply prompt a kind of social "imperialism", managed by the market economic powers, yet additionally a sort of social control (Zao & Murdock, 1996), where there is a "standard": an undetectable status quo, where one needs to touch, to qualify as the piece of "the" general public. Thus influence individuals to go for a retail treatment, to cure their sorrow and unfulfilled wants profiting the modern mammoths particularly and the media for the most part (Atoley & Meloy, 2011).

3.5. Identity through Commodity

Our dressing is a part of our correspondence with others, where we enlighten others regarding our identity and which social class we have a place with; consequently, fashion is likewise a piece of our personality (Davis, 1994). This notion has been controlled by the media that continues changing the

perspective of the world for its consumers, makes new needs, and influences that seller offer for best. This is a conflict, that "commoditization of self", is really an approach to make poor people, remain poor, and the rich remain rich. However, the thought of communication through clothing has likewise been very much considered through the way of culture industry. Fashion is a dialect between social identity of an individual and his/her self-character.

The audiences are persistently served through a progression of thoughts, what they should adopt to look trendy. The assortment gave by the promoters in the media is enormous to the point that people particularly ladies are overpowered by disarray (Bakewell & Mitchell, 2003).

4. Culture Industry in Digital World

On account of the improvement of advanced innovations in computers and media communications hardware, an ever increasing number of cultural artifacts are being created, put away, and conveyed digitally. The expanded speed of advanced gadgets and developments in computer systems and computerized pressure innovations make it both simpler and more affordable to convey words, music, images, and pictures to buyers around the globe cultural enterprises obliging mass groups of targeted consumers to utilize one-way circulation frameworks (e.g. TV and radio telecom) and put away media like CDs and DVDs to convey their productions to mass audiences. The interactivity of computerized innovations and document sharing of progressively vast advanced records by means of the Internet is making plans of action commenced on

one-way conveyance and the offer of substance on put away media progressively out of date (Hart, 2009).

4.1. *Who controls the Media?*

Pakistani media is influenced by many visible and invisible pressures. Sometimes pressure is exerted by the Government, Military and sometimes by the giant financiers. Pressure by political forces on media is for the most part done in an indirect way. One device generally utilized by the legislature is to cut off 'unfriendly' media from advertisements by the government. Utilizing arbitrary laws, the legislature has likewise prohibited or authoritatively hushing mainstream TV slots.

The Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA) has been utilized to hush electronic media by either suspending licenses or by just undermining to do as such. Also, media is likewise presented to propaganda from state institutions, compelled by intense political components and non-state characters particularly during last two decades' war on terror (Media in Pakistan, 2009). Likewise, there is always a pressure by military forces that no content against the Army or any official of Army will be published or broadcasted (Siddiq, 2007). While we discuss, media as culture industry is a main culprit of promoting consumerism, commodification of audiences and manipulating the people's mind to gain economic benefits, there are other factors that connect and facilitate together to influence the things to work for media and financial powers. A recent example is of Bahria Town Karachi case, in which Supreme Court in final

verdict declared this project illegal on land issue with the government but no electronic or print media highlighted this news except Dawn Newspaper, the reason of this blackout is that Bahria town is the main advertiser to the media industry in Pakistan.

4.2. *Ownership Patterns of Media*

There are three main media conglomerates in Pakistan which hold the print media market. First largest is Jang Group owned by *Mir Shakil-Ur-Rehman*. This group under its umbrella owns a publishing house and newspapers like, *Daily Jang*, *The News International*, *Mag weekly*, and *Awam* while in electronic media they own *Geo News*, *Geo Taz*, *Geo Super*, *Geo Entertainment*, *Aag TV* and *Geo Kahani*. The second largest group is Dawn. They have Dawn newspaper; *Herald* a current affair magazine, and evening newspaper *The Star*, *Spider* a monthly magazine on internet. In electronic media they own Dawn News. *Nawa-i-waqt* is the third largest group they own English newspaper *The Nation*, *Nawa-i-waqt Urdu* (Media in Pakistan, 2009).

In electronic media ARY group owns a number of channels like *ARY News*, *ARY Digital*, *ARY Zindagi*, *ARY Zouq*, *Q TV* and hold many other businesses like, *ARY Gold*, *ARY jewelers*, *ARY Sahulat Bazar*, ARY speed remit and telecom services (Media in Pakistan, 2009). In such a situation of media ownership, where there is a substantial control over the stream of information, by such corporate administrations, it isn't the consumers that get advantages, yet the conglomerates itself (Hanitzsch & Berganza, 2012).

5. Conclusion

This paper concludes that idea of Adorno and Horkheimer “The culture industry: Enlightenment and Mass deception” seems true. Today culture industry of Pakistan is invaded by the corporate and industrialist sector. Media is playing an important role in promotion of consumerism. Today culture is infecting with “sameness”. Mostly we realized that there is no autonomy in cultural artifacts because commercialization of culture industry is destroying the true meaning of the cultural products. The ultimate goal of Television, Newspaper, Movies and other cultural industries is profit. Media instead of serving the society is actually serving the corporate world. Ownership patterns of media show a monopoly of few people. Flow of information is controlled by the three media conglomerates.

However, few people are putting their efforts to produce the content with unique ideas, to serve the social issues to educate the people but they are very few. It is now need of time for policy makers, legislators and the regulators to regulate the media in the best interest of the society, and break the monopoly of few people on the whole media industry. It is also necessary to regulate the advertisements and focus should be on the content. Audience’s treatment like commodities should be reconsidered on the part of the media owners and advertisers as well. In the race of ratings media is losing its credibility and ruining the beauty of cultural artifacts so, it is a need of time that media should re-evaluate its responsibilities to regain its prestige. Studying the present social domain through

the lens of *Horkheimer* and *Adorno*, it is surely evident that the today’s world persistently legitimizes the treatment of cultural products as a processing plant which makes practically equivalent to mass-created content, fashioned as an item and sold to the mass gathering of people as a uniform culture item. In today’s social order we know that cultural industries manufacture such cultural artifacts for mass consumption which actually are just cash making wanders which neglects the human personality and treat its audiences as commodity. This industry is just serving the capitalist corporate system by negating the human identity and needs of mass audiences. In fact, contemporary cultural industries depend on shallow, settled, standard substance to propitiate the assumed “demand” for purposely absurd culture items which at that point mean a more prominent profit for capital and a managed territory over the mass group of consumers.

References

- Adamu, A. (2017). Commodification of Culture the Political Economy of the Hausa Popular Cultural Industries. *National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN) Jabi, Abuja*.
- Adorno, T.W. (1932). On the social situation of music. *Telos*, 1978.
- Adorno, T.W. (1938). On the fetish character of music and the regression of hearing. In E. Gebhardt, & A. Arato (Eds.). *The essential Frankfurt School reader*. New York: Continuum.

- Adorno, T. & Horkheimer, M. (1944). *The Culture Industry: Enlightenment as mass deception*. New York, NY: *Social Studies Association*.
- Ajaz, M. (2017, April 24). The changing face of Pakistani dramas. *DAILY TIMES PAKISTAN*.
- Altheide, D. L. (1997). The news media, the problem frame, and the production of fear. *The sociological quarterly*, 38(4), 647-668.
- Atalay, A. S., & Meloy, M. G. (2011). Retail therapy: A strategic effort to improve mood. *Psychology & Marketing*, 28(6), 638-659.
- Bakewell, C., & Mitchell, V. W. (2003). Generation Y female consumer decision-making styles. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 31(2), 95-106.
- Butt, R. (2016, December 09). Ramadan Shows – Transmissions or Transformations! Retrieved from <https://reviewit.pk/ramazan-shows-transmissions-or-transformations/>
- Davis, F. (1994). *Fashion, culture, and identity*. University of Chicago Press.
- Enzensberger, H. M. (1974). *The consciousness industry*. New York: *Seabury*.
- Goodwilliam, C. (2014). How can a political economy framework illuminate the practices and contradictions of Google? *M.A. dissertation, Warwick University, UK*.
- Garnham, N. (1994). *Capitalism and communication: Global culture and the economics of Information*. London: *Sage Publications*.
- Gerbner, G., & Gross, L. (1976). Living with television: The violence profile. *Journal of Communication*, 26(2), 172-199.
- Golding, P. & Murdock, G. (1996). Culture, communications and political economy, In M. Gurevitch & J. Curran (Eds.). *Mass Media and Society, Fourth Edition* (pp. 11-30). London: *Arnold*.
- Hanitzsch, T., & Berganza, R. (2012). Explaining journalists' trust in public institutions across 20 countries: Media freedom, corruption, and ownership matter most. *Journal of Communication*, 62(5), 794-814.
- Hart, J. (2009). *Toward a Political Economy of Digital Culture: From Organized Mass Consumption to Attention Rivalry*. *Journal of Cultural Policies and Power*.
- Hall, S. (1989). *Ideology and Communication theory, Rethinking communication theory*. Sage, *Newbury Park*.
- Herman, E.S. & Chomsky, N. (2002). *Manufacturing Consent: The political economy of Mass Media*. *Pantheon Books, New York*.
- Herzog, H. (1941). On borrowed experience. An analysis of listening to daytime sketches. *Studies in Philosophy and Social Science*, 9 (1), 65-95.
- Horkheimer, M., & Adorno, T. W. (2001). The culture industry: Enlightenment as mass deception. *Media and cultural studies: Key works*, 71-101.

- Huma, J. (2015). Analytical Study of Television Drama Narratives. *Mass Communicate Journalism*, 5(8).
- Kaur, B. (2014). Product Placement in Movies: The Bollywood Experience. *Global Journal of Finance and Management*, 6(1), 53-58.
- Kellner, D. (1990). Television and the crisis of Democracy. *Westview press Boulder*.
- Khan, M. (2013, October 29). *Morning Show Circus: Who Tops the Chart?* Retrieved from <https://www.brandsynario.com/morning-show-circus-who-tops-the-chart/>
- Kripalani, C. (2007). Trendsetting and product placement in Bollywood film: Consumerism Through consumption. *New Cinemas: Journal of Contemporary Film*, 4(3), 197-215.
- Lowenthal, L. (1949). *Prophets of deceit*. New York: Harper.
- McNair, B. (2000). Power, Profit, Corruption and Lies: The Russian Media in the 1990s. *Westernizing Media studies*, Routledge, New York.
- Meehan, E. (1984). Ratings and the Institutional Approach: A Third Answer to the Commodity Question. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 1(2), 216–25.
- Mirza, Z. (2016, December 01). *Lesson learnt from morning shows in 2016*. Retrieved from <https://reviewit.pk/lessons-learnt-from-morning-shows-in-2016/>
- Mont, O., & Power, K. (2010). The Role of Formal and Informal Forces in Shaping Consumption and Implications for a Sustainable Society. Part I. *Sustainability*, 2(7), 2232-2252.
- Mosco, V. (2009). The political economy of communication. *Los Angeles: Sage Publications*.
- Mosco, V. (1996). The Political economy of Communication. *Sage, London*.
- Narayanan, R. (2003). Bulle Shah's Progress. *India International Centre Quarterly*, 30(3/4), 38-42.
- Power, K., & Mont, O. (2010). The role of formal and informal forces in shaping consumption and implications for sustainable society: Part II. *Sustainability*, 2(8), 2573-2592.
- Rahman, A. (2017). Political Economy of Private TV channels in Bangladesh: A critique. *Asian Profile*, 45(6), 17-28.
- Report by International Media support Organization. (2009, July) Retrieved from: <https://www.mediasupport.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/11/ims-media-pakistan-radicalisation-2009.pdf> retrieved on May 27
- www.arygold.com
- www.aryjewellers.com.pk
- www.Sahulatbazar.co.ul
- www.speedremit.com
- www.ary-telecom.com
- Sadaf. (2013, January 27). *Five Pakistani Drama Stereotypes we need to break*. Retrieved

- from <http://blush.com.pk/five-pakistani-drama-stereotypes-we-need-to-break/>
- Sajjad, S. (2014, July 15). *Greed and Desire: The new face of Ramazan?* Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1121544>
- Sartaj, M. (2015, October 20). *How Pakistani morning shows are keeping women 'where they belong.* Retrieved from <https://images.dawn.com/news/1174074>
- Schooler, D., Monique Ward, L., Merriwether, A., & Caruthers, A. (2004). Who's that girl? Television's role in the body image development of young white and black women? *Psychology of women quarterly*, 28(1), 38-47.
- Shah, B. (2015, September 28). Journalism in Pakistan: Fear and Favor. *The New York Times*.
- Siddiqa, A. (2007). How Pakistan's Military Manages the Media? *Military Inc.: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*.
- Singh, J.P. (2006). APSA Short Course on Culture Industries, Technologies, and Policies.
- Smythe, D. W. (1977), 'Communications: Blindspot of western Marxism', *Canadian Journal of Political and Social Theory*.1 (3), 1–27.
- Unproductive' product placements we could have done without. (2015, August 20). Retrieved from <https://www.thenews.com.pk/magazine/us/77083-unproductive-product-placements-we-could-have-done-without>
- Zhao, B., & Murdock, G. (1996). Young pioneers: Children and the making of Chinese consumerism. *Cultural studies*, 10(2), 201-2.